

# TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF FAMILY AND PROTECTIVE SERVICES

**COMMISSIONER**Anne Heiligenstein

September 30, 2011

The Honorable Rick Perry Governor of Texas P.O. Box 12428 Austin, Texas 78711

The Honorable Steve Ogden Chairman Senate Finance Committee Texas Senate P.O. Box 12068 Capitol Station Austin, Texas 78711-2068

The Honorable Jim Pitts Chairman, House Committee on Appropriations Texas House of Representatives P.O. Box 2910 Austin, Texas 78768-2910

Mr. John O'Brien, Director Texas Legislative Budget Board P.O. Box 12666 Austin, Texas 78711-2666

Dear Governor Perry and Legislative Leadership:

Pursuant to Rider 11, House Bill 1, 82<sup>nd</sup> Regular Legislative Session, Department of Family and Protective Services (DFPS) is directed to develop a Human Resources Management Plan designed to improve employee morale and retention. The plan must focus on reducing employee turnover through better management. The FY 2012 Human Resources Management Plan will build on the success of previous years' retention efforts. Per the requirements of Rider 11, we respectfully submit the following items:

Letter to Governor Perry and Legislative Leadership September 29, 2011 Page 2

- a summary of progress made on the FY 2011 Human Resources Management Plan;
- a discussion of the turnover statistics for FY 2011;
- an analysis of workforce retention challenges; and
- an outline of the initiatives for the new FY 2012 Human Resources Management Plan.

Retaining staff is critical for DFPS to achieve its mission of protecting children, the elderly and people with disabilities from abuse, neglect and exploitation by involving clients, families and communities. The current turnover rate of 17.4 percent is slightly lower than it was in FY 2010. Over the past few years, DFPS has made remarkable strides in reducing turnover. The ongoing efforts and projects in the 2012 Human Resources Management Plan should have a positive impact on turnover.

Thank you for the opportunity to present this information.

Sincerely,

Anne Heiligenstein

Enclosures

cc: Andria Franco, Office of the Governor
Sarah Hicks, Senate Committee on Finance
Brittani Bilse, Senate Committee on Finance
Amy Peterson, House Committee on Appropriations
Nelda Hunter, House Committee on Appropriations
Nancy Millard, Legislative Budget Board

# Rider 11 - Human Resources Management Plan

A Report from

The Texas Department of Family and Protective Services

**September 30, 2011** 

### Introduction

House Bill 1, Rider 11, 82<sup>nd</sup> Regular Legislative Session directs the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services (DFPS) to develop a Human Resources Management Plan designed to improve employee morale and retention. The plan must focus on reducing employee turnover through better management. The effectiveness of the agency's plan shall be measured by whether there is a reduction in annual employee turnover rates at the agency, specifically by the reduction in the turnover rates for caseworkers.

To review the new FY 2012 Human Resources Management Plan within the context of the past year, this document includes the following:

- A summary of progress made on the FY 2011 Human Resources Management Plan
- A discussion of the turnover statistics for FY 2011
- An analysis of workforce retention challenges
- An outline of the FY 2012 Human Resources Management Plan
- Appendix: Turnover and HR-Related Data for Fiscal Years 2010 and 2011

# **FY 2010 Human Resources Management Plan**

The FY 2010 Human Resources Management Plan outlined a series of projects DFPS was to undertake that year. The following table shows the status of those projects:

## **FY 2011 Human Resources Management Plan Projects**

Project	Status
2010 Survey of Employee Engagement Action Tracking Much of the data supporting projects undertaken in the Human Resources Management Plan comes from the SEE. This survey was last administered to DFPS employees in February and March 2010. Data has been shared with the appropriate managers. These managers will be assigned to take action on their results. The actions will be tracked centrally and will be shared with staff.	Complete Eighty-one managers from across the state submitted a total of 115 post-survey actions they are taking. They provided routine updates on the progress of their actions toward the target completion dates and success metrics. Selected success stories were shared with all staff in the agency newsletter on September 21, 2011.
FY 2010 DFPS Exit Survey Results DFPS began surveying individuals terminating employment with the agency in January 2009. This survey is more extensive than the survey administered by the State Auditor's Office and is customized to the agency's needs. The survey data from FY 2010 will be analyzed for agencywide issues. Regional data will be shared with CPS and APS regional directors. Licensing district data will be shared with CCL district directors.	Complete The exit survey annual report was distributed internally in December 2010. It included breakdowns of the survey data by program for CPS, APS, CCL (including RCCL) and SWI. The data was also broken down by region. All comments from respondents to both the DFPS and SAO exit surveys are shared with executive staff on a quarterly basis.

Project	Status
Recruitment of Bilingual Staff DFPS serves many	In Progress A recruitment plan encompassing this
clients who do not speak English as their primary	project and the rural recruitment project has been
language. To better serve these clients and to reduce	drafted. The plan will be shared with agency leadership
spending on translation services, DFPS needs a number	and maintained by the Management Support Division.
of caseworkers who can communicate with clients in	and maintained by the framingement support 2 mission.
languages other than English, particularly in Spanish	
and Vietnamese. DFPS will explore ways to attract	
bilingual applicants for direct delivery jobs.	
Recruitment in Rural Areas DFPS has field offices	In Progress See above.
throughout the state, some located in urban areas and	
some located in rural areas. Many times hiring	
specialists experience low applicant pools for jobs that	
are located in rural areas. DFPS will investigate ways to	
attract applicants to direct delivery jobs in rural areas.	
Rookie Year On-Boarding Implementation The	Complete Support tools for the rookie year on-
Workforce Support and Retention Initiative (WSRI)	boarding concept are available for managers on the
Valuing Employees work group discovered that many	agency intranet. When hiring specialists hire for
employers tend to view the on-boarding process as	caseworker positions, they inform the new employee's
taking somewhere between a day and a week. In their	supervisor about the materials. Feedback will be
research, the work group found that this process takes	gathered from new employees on a regular basis to
much longer and begins before the employee arrives for	determine where future improvements can be made in
the first day of work. The work group developed the	the Rookie Year On-Boarding process.
rookie year on-boarding concept to help supervisors	
welcome and support their new employees through the	
first year.	
Statewide Intake Retention Statewide Intake	Ongoing Statewide Intake launched a new system for
undertook a retention initiative during fiscal years 2009	continuous improvement of workplace satisfaction and
and 2010. During that time, Statewide Intake went from	retention. Statewide Intake formed the Retention
being the program with the highest turnover to falling	Initiative Steering Committee (RISC) to design
more in line with the other DFPS programs. In fiscal	and conduct a workplace satisfaction survey. With
year 2011, Statewide Intake will undertake several new	ongoing RISC guidance, six workgroups used the
projects aimed at reducing turnover even further.	survey results to develop proposals to the Statewide
	Intake management team. The areas of focus included:
	promoting employee communication and input,
	strengthening supervision, managing workloads, valuing
	employees and the needs of night/weekend staff. The
	management team is currently considering the
	proposals.

#### Project Status

#### Marketing the Career Ladder Program --

Certification is a process where direct delivery staff and their supervisors earn pay increases by achieving specific amounts of tenure, completing approved training programs and maintaining satisfactory performance. When the Protective Services Training Institute (PSTI) processed certification applications, they viewed certification as something that must be maintained. Since taking over processing certification applications, DFPS has changed this philosophy. DFPS views achieving a level of certification as a distinct event. Therefore, certification is really a career ladder program. To highlight the change in philosophy, the DFPS Certification logo includes the slogan, "Climb the Ladder." This slogan communicates to employees that through certification, employees can advance their careers. DFPS will further develop "Climb the Ladder" and market certification to existing staff and job applicants.

Ongoing -- Certification is being marketed to staff with both push and pull strategies. Information is pushed to staff through targeted webinars. Staff members eligible for the certification program and nearing achievement of their tenure requirement are invited to attend a webinar on the certification process. The one-hour sessions give staff a brief overview of the process. Then, the remainder of the hour is devoted to answering questions the attendees have. Information is pulled by staff from the Intranet. Staff can easily access information about the certification program with one click from the home page of the DFPS intranet. The Intranet page includes requirements documents, help tools, frequently asked questions and contact information for people who can provide customer service.

## **FY 2011 Turnover Results**

Overall, turnover measures at DFPS for FY 2011 show slight decreases below FY 2010. The agency's turnover rate decreased from 17.4 percent in FY 2010 to 17.1 percent in FY 2011. Turnover went down in each of the four major programs in DFPS for both front-line staff and all staff. Certainly the national economic downturn helped employee retention at DFPS during the year as people had fewer options in the job market, and government employment offers more stability than the private sector.

Supervisors are critical to retention, so knowing how the agency is doing in retaining supervisors is important to the efforts of retaining caseworkers. Only CPS experienced a decrease in turnover among supervisors in the four programs. CCL held steady. APS and SWI saw increases. It is important to note that the number of supervisors in CCL, APS and SWI is very small, so a handful of people can have large implications on the supervisor turnover rate within a particular program.

Overall, the agency experienced slight decreases in turnover across the primary turnover measures. DFPS will continue to work on employee retention issues seeking new ways to make the work environment better for employees so that they can provide the best services possible to clients.

Turnover statistics are shown in the appendix of this report.

# **DFPS Analysis of Workforce Retention Challenges**

DFPS uses multiple sources of information about why employees leave the agency and why employees stay. Several key sources are described below:

## Survey of Employee Engagement (SEE)

The data gathered through the SEE assists DFPS to understand, from the viewpoint of the employee, what the organization is doing well, where improvement efforts should be targeted, and how employees perceive various aspects of the workplace. The SEE is conducted in state agencies every two years by the Institute for Organizational Excellence at the University of Texas and was

last administered in February and March 2010. According to the 2010 SEE results, DFPS employees rated the agency highest in the following constructs: supervision, strategic, information systems, employee development and team. According to the SEE researchers, the high response rate in 2010 – 66 percent – indicates "that employees have a reasonable investment in the organization, want to see the organization improve and generally have a sense of responsibility to the organization." The next iteration of the SEE will be in early calendar year 2012.

## The State Auditor's Office (SAO) Survey of Exiting Employees

In 2001, legislation was passed requiring the SAO to develop an online employee exit survey as a direct source for employees to provide feedback about their reasons for leaving state employment. HHS agencies have had some challenges in getting these surveys completed by departing staff, and the data is of somewhat limited use as currently collected and presented by the SAO. DFPS reviews and analyzes all responses received. There were 322 surveys completed in FY 2011. For both the SAO and DFPS surveys, responses are reviewed on a monthly basis. Comments are forwarded to the appropriate executive team member. An annual report aggregating the quantitative data is developed for the executive team.

## **DFPS Exit Survey**

The DFPS Exit Survey was launched in January 2009. Its goal is to gather the opinions of exiting employees about the positive and negative aspects of working at DFPS, what caused them to leave and what DFPS can do to keep employees. There were 316 surveys completed in FY 2011.

#### Regional All-Staff Meetings

Over the past few years, the Commissioner, Deputy Commissioner and Executive Team of DFPS have participated in the regional all-staff meetings in every region of the state. During these meetings staff are given the opportunity to provide candid feedback about morale and conditions in the agency.

#### **Independent Studies**

A variety of external studies are done on employee retention in the human services field in general and several on DFPS in particular. In the past year, these have included theses and dissertations by Master's and PhD-level researchers, focused on CPS worker retention.

Out of these various sources of information, a core group of underlying causes for turnover were identified:

#### Compensation

According to the 2010 SEE results, 71 percent of DFPS employees do not believe that they are paid fairly for the work they do. Sixty-four percent felt that their salaries weren't competitive with similar jobs in their communities. Seventy-seven percent said that their pay does not keep pace with the cost of living. Over the past few iterations of the SEE, the pay construct has significantly lagged behind all other constructs measured by the survey. While DFPS recognizes pay as a factor contributing to turnover, a significant barrier to increasing pay at DFPS is the cost impact.

## Support for New Caseworkers

When caseworkers leave DFPS, they typically do so within the first two years of employment. In FY 2011, the turnover rate for entry level CPS workers was 35.2 percent. The turnover rate for entry level APS workers was 22.1 percent. Caseworkers start their jobs in a 12-week training program, and by the end of the first two years, they are functioning with a full caseload. During these two years, learning is constant, and expectations are continually increased. To provide

quality service to clients, it is critical that DFPS systematically select caseworkers and equip them to succeed. DFPS has a career ladder program for caseworkers and their supervisors, and the timeframes for movement between steps vary across programs.

#### Workload Concerns

Many DFPS employees feel overworked. Thirty-seven percent of respondents to the 2010 SEE survey said that the amount of work they are asked to do is unreasonable. Thirty-four percent felt that their work environment did not support a balance between work and personal life. DFPS has made strides in recent years in hardware and software technology to make employee's work easier. On the 2010 SEE, 77 percent of employees said that information systems are in place and accessible for them to get their jobs done. It is critical to retention that DFPS reduce workload where possible and support employees where reduction is not possible.

#### Supervision

Over the past few iterations of the SEE, the construct score for supervision has risen from one of the more poorly performing areas to the highest scoring construct. The turnover rate for CPS supervisors was 5.6 percent in FY 2011. In the same period, the rate was 8.8 percent for APS. With supervisors leaving the agency, caseworkers with management potential must be promoted. Given that the typical caseworker is a new college graduate, a new DFPS supervisor will likely be in his or her first formal management role. Therefore, preparing and training new managers is incredibly important. When parting employees respond negatively on either the DFPS or SAO exit survey, often the comments cite problems with particular managers.

# FY 2012 Human Resources Management Plan

The FY 2012 Human Resources Management Plan is comprised of ongoing efforts and one-time projects that seek to address the underlying causes for turnover mentioned earlier.

## Organizational Effectiveness Facilitation

The Organizational Effectiveness (OE) team provides continuous quality improvement support services to all DFPS programs and divisions to promote successful outcomes for children, adults, and families. Through a series of face-to-face meetings, an OE facilitator helps a group drill down to the root causes of complex problems and then develops and implements strategies to solve those problems. Upper-level managers can request facilitation sessions for groups under their supervision.

## Sharing Exit Survey Information with Leadership

When employees leave DFPS, they are asked to fill out two surveys -- one from the State Auditor's Office and one from DFPS. Each month, the Management Support Division reviews the comments that survey respondents make. All comments alleging work rule violations are forwarded to the appropriate agency executive and the Legal Division. Comments praising a coworker or supervisor are forwarded to the appropriate director of field operations for programs or state office division director.

# Promoting the Career Ladder Program

The career ladder program for caseworkers and supervisors requires that employees achieve a particular amount of tenure, complete a prescribed training program and maintain satisfactory performance in order to reach the next step in the ladder. DFPS staff who administer the career ladder program monitor employee tenure data to warn employees several months before they

reach a tenure milestone by inviting them to monthly webinars on how to apply for their promotion.

#### Rookie Year On-Boarding Surveys

The Rookie Year On-Boarding program was started last summer. As part of notifying programmatic supervisors that they have a new employee, hiring specialists direct the supervisors to Rookie Year materials on the DFPS intranet. New employees are surveyed at 3- 6- and 12-month tenure marks. Survey data will be used to improve the Rookie Year On-Boarding program as necessary.

#### Statewide Intake Retention Initiative Steering Committee

The Statewide Intake Retention Initiative Steering Committee (RISC) undertakes projects to improve the work environment at the agency's abuse and neglect call center. With ongoing RISC guidance, six workgroups used the survey results to develop proposals to the Statewide Intake management team. The areas of focus included: promoting employee communication and input, strengthening supervision, managing workloads, valuing employees and the needs of night/weekend staff.

## **GoMobile Project**

GoMobile is an agency-wide initiative to build a coordinated work model that integrates our workforce, our work environments, and our technology. It will lead to a cost savings in salary hours, real estate, travel and overhead expense. The project is coordinated with the HHSC Teleworking, Mobile Work and Alternative Officing Initiatives.

## Survey of Employee Engagement 2012 Iteration

The Center for Program Coordination will work with the University of Texas to administer the Survey of Employee Engagement in 2010. During FY 2011, DFPS managers took specific actions in response to the 2012 iteration of the survey.

#### **DFPS SAVES**

DFPS faces major budget challenges in the upcoming year and expects those challenges to continue through the next few budget cycles. To collect ideas about opportunities to gain efficiencies, the agency instituted the DFPS Suggestions to Achieve Value and Efficiency in Services (SAVES) program. DFPS has already put in place some cost savings measures and will continue to review existing programs to ensure the agency is operating as efficiently and effectively as possible. Employees can fill out a survey at any time with their suggestions on ways DFPS can use resources more efficiently. When staff have their ideas heard, they are more engaged with the work and the agency.

#### **DFPS LEADS**

DFPS LEADS (Leadership Excellence, Advancement, Distinction and Support) is a project to align the training and professional development of DFPS managers. The goal is to produce managers who have the tactical knowledge to manage their day-to-day duties and can act strategically with broad goals in mind. Managers gain programmatic knowledge and develop in the eight competencies DFPS has identified as essential for managing in the DFPS environment: (1) managing change, (2) collaboration, (3) communication, (4) cultural competence, (5) decision making, (6) professional development of self and others, (7) integrity and (8) strategic thinking.

# Conclusion

Retaining staff is critical for DFPS to achieve its mission of protecting children, the elderly and people with disabilities from abuse, neglect and exploitation by involving clients, families and communities. The current turnover rate of 17.4 percent is slightly lower than it was in FY 2010. Over the past few years, DFPS has made remarkable strides in reducing turnover. The ongoing efforts and projects in the 2012 Human Resources Management Plan should have a positive impact on turnover.

#### APPENDIX: RIDER 13 EMPLOYEE ANNUALIZED TURNOVER REPORT

Department of Family and Protective Services (DFPS)

Functional Title	FY 2010 Average	FY 2010 Turnover	FY 2011 Average	FY 2011 Turnover
	Employees	Rate <sup>1</sup>	Employees	Rate <sup>1</sup>
All Employees	11,469.3	17.4%	11,396.8	17.1%

#### Child Protective Services (CPS)

Functional Title	FY 2010 Average Employees	FY 2010 Turnover Rate <sup>1</sup>	FY 2011 Average Employees	FY 2011 Turnover Rate <sup>1</sup>
CPS Workers	4,996.5	25.4%	5,027.8	25.0%
CPS Supervisors	831.0	6.0%	803.8	5.6%
CPS Program <sup>3</sup>	8,134.8	19.2%	8,275.3	18.8%
CPS Specialist II <sup>2</sup>	2,548.5	35.6%	2,458.0	35.2%
CPS Specialist III	1,232.0	19.3%	1,191.3	20.8%
CPS Specialist IV	959.3	10.4%	1,095.3	10.3%
CPS Specialist V	81.8	4.9%	78.8	5.1%
CPS Special Investigator	175.0	12.0%	204.5	13.7%
CPS CVS Caseworker	1,594.0	22.5%	1, 601.0	22.7%
CPS FBSS Caseworker	878.5	28.9%	844.8	27.3%
CPS INV Caseworker	1,868.8	32.3%	1,881.5	31.7%

#### Adult Protective Services (APS)

Functional Title	FY 2010 Average Employees	FY 2010 Turnover Rate <sup>1</sup>	FY 2011 Average Employees	FY 2011 Turnover Rate <sup>1</sup>
APS Workers	701.5	18.1%	728.5	16.2%
APS Supervisors	108.5	7.4%	113.3	8.8%
APS Program <sup>3</sup>	963.0	15.1%	1,037.8	13.9%

## Child Care Licensing (CCL)

Functional Title	FY 2010 Average Employees	FY 2010 Turnover Rate <sup>1</sup>	FY 2011 Average Employees	FY 2011 Turnover Rate <sup>1</sup>
CCL Workers <sup>4</sup>	270.8	12.9%	272.3	11.8%
CCL Supervisors	35.8	0.0%	37.0	0.0%
CCL Program <sup>3</sup>	372.3	11.0%	407.8	10.8%

#### Residential Child Care Licensing (RCCL)

( · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				
Functional Title	FY 2010 Average Employees	FY 2010 Turnover Rate <sup>1</sup>	FY 2011 Average Employees	FY 2011 Turnover Rate <sup>1</sup>
RCCL Workers <sup>4</sup>	122.3	13.9%	128.8	8.5%
RCCL Supervisors	22.8	4.4%	23.8	4.2%
RCCL Program <sup>3</sup>	173.0	13.9%	182.8	8.8%

#### Statewide Intake (SWI)

Functional Title	FY 2010 Average Employees	FY 2010 Turnover Rate <sup>1</sup>	FY 2011 Average Employees	FY 2011 Turnover Rate <sup>1</sup>
SWI Workers	338.8	18.6%	346.5	17.9%
SWI Supervisors	33.5	0.0%	36.0	13.9%
SWI Program <sup>3</sup>	439.8	17.3%	454.5	17.2%

<sup>1</sup>NOTE: DFPS calculates turnover using the SAO method: (the total number of regular employees who terminated during the period DIVIDED BY the average number of regular active employees during the period) TIMES 100 to produce a percentage. The terminated count includes all terminations, including interagency transfers, and employees are counted as terminated even if they subsequently return to DFPS during the period. Employees who terminate multiple times during the period are counted once for each termination event. The average number of regular active employees is calculated by counting every employee who worked for DFPS at any time during the quarter for each quarter during the period, and dividing the total by the number of quarter(s) in the period.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Entry level for CPS workers is CPS Specialist II. The state classification for this level is Protective Services Specialist II.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>Because program group totals include all employees in that program, this number will exceed the total number of workers and supervisors in the program.

<sup>4</sup>CCL and RCCL Workers include employees serving in worker job codes and in the Inspector job codes.